## COMPSCI 514: Optional Problem Set 5

## Due: December 12th by 11:59pm in Gradescope.

This problem set is optional. If you complete it, the points will count towards extra credit on top of your prior problem sets.

## Instructions:

- Each group should work together to produce a single solution set. One member should submit a solution pdf to Gradescope, marking the other members as part of their group.
- You may talk to members of other groups at a high level about the problems but not work through the solutions in detail together.
- You must show your work/derive any answers as part of the solutions to receive full credit.


## 1. Convex Functions and Sets (15 points)

1. For each of the functions below, either prove that it is convex, or give a counter example showing that it is not.
(a) (1 point) $f: \mathbb{R}^{d} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ with $f(\vec{x})=\|\vec{x}\|_{2}$.
(b) (1 point) $f: \mathbb{R}^{d} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ with $f(\vec{x})=\|\vec{x}-\vec{c}\|_{2}$, where $\vec{c}$ is some fixed vector.
(c) (1 point) $f: \mathbb{R}^{n \times d} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ with $f(A)=\operatorname{rank}(A)$.
(d) (1 point) $f: \mathbb{R}^{n \times n} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ with $f(A)=\operatorname{tr}(A)$.
2. For each of the sets below, either prove that it is convex, or give a counter example showing that it is not.
(a) (1 point) $\{\vec{x}: f(\vec{x}) \leq c\}$ where $c$ is any scalar constant and $f$ is a convex function.
(b) (1 point) $\left\{\vec{y} \in \mathbb{R}^{n}: \exists \vec{x} \in \mathbb{R}^{d}\right.$ with $\left.\vec{y}=A \vec{x}\right\}$, where $A \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times d}$ is any fixed matrix.
(c) (1 point) $\left\{A \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times d}: \operatorname{rank}(A) \leq k\right\}$ where $k$ is some fixed integer.
(d) (1 point) $\left\{\vec{x} \in \mathbb{R}^{n}: \vec{x}(i) \in[0,1]\right.$ for all $i$ and $\left.\sum_{i=1}^{d} \vec{x}(i)=1\right\}$.
3. Consider the following optimization problem involving the Laplacian $\mathbf{L} \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ of a graph.

$$
\min _{\vec{x} \in \mathbb{R}^{n}:\|\vec{x}\|_{2}=1 \text { and } \vec{x}^{T} \overrightarrow{1}=0} \vec{x}^{T} \mathbf{L} \vec{x} .
$$

(a) (1 point) Where have we seen this optimization problem before? What is the solution?
(b) (2 points) Prove that a sum of two convex functions is always convex.
(c) (2 points) Prove that the objective function $f(\vec{x})=\vec{x}^{T} \mathbf{L} \vec{x}$ is convex. Hint: It may be helpful to use part (2) here along with the formula for $\vec{x}^{T} \mathbf{L} \vec{x}$ in terms of 'smoothness' of $\vec{x}$ over the graph.
(d) (2 points) Is the above a convex optimization problem over a convex constraint set?

## 2. Gradient Descent with a Decaying Step Size (8 points)

In class we showed that gradient descent with step size $\eta=\frac{R}{G \sqrt{t}}$ converges to an $\epsilon$ approximate minimizer in $t=\frac{R^{2} G^{2}}{\epsilon^{2}}$ steps, for a convex $G$-Lipschitz function starting from an initial point $\vec{\theta}_{1}$ within a radius $R$ of the optimum. This fixed step size analysis requires that we pick $\epsilon$ ahead of time and set $\eta$ based on $\epsilon$. However, in many applications we don't want to fix $\epsilon$, but want to attain higher and higher accuracy as we run for longer. Here, we will analyze a variant of gradient descent with a gradually decreasing step size that allows us to do this.

Consider gradient descent with the update $\vec{\theta}_{i+1}=\vec{\theta}_{i}-\eta_{i} \vec{\nabla} f\left(\vec{\theta}_{i}\right)$, where the step size is set as

$$
\eta_{i}=\frac{f\left(\vec{\theta}_{i}\right)-f\left(\vec{\theta}_{*}\right)}{\left\|\vec{\nabla} f\left(\vec{\theta}_{i}\right)\right\|_{2}^{2}}
$$

Note that using this step size requires knowledge of $f\left(\vec{\theta}_{*}\right)$, but not of $\vec{\theta}_{*}$, which may be reasonable in some settings. More complex approaches can remove the need to know this value.

1. (2 points) Let $d_{i}=f\left(\vec{\theta}_{i}\right)-f\left(\vec{\theta}_{*}\right)$ be our error at step $i$. Prove that with the above step size:

$$
d_{i}^{2} \leq G^{2} \cdot\left(\left\|\vec{\theta}_{i}-\vec{\theta}_{*}\right\|_{2}^{2}-\left\|\vec{\theta}_{i+1}-\vec{\theta}_{*}\right\|_{2}^{2}\right) .
$$

Hint: Start with the single step analysis shown in class, applied with step size $\eta_{i}$.
2. (1 point) Argue via Cauchy-Schwarz that $\frac{1}{t} \sum_{i=1}^{t} d_{i} \leq \frac{1}{\sqrt{t}} \sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{t} d_{i}^{2}}$.
3. (2 points) Use parts (1) and (2) to show that after $t$ steps:

$$
\frac{1}{t} \sum_{i=1}^{t}\left[f\left(\vec{\theta}_{i}\right)-f\left(\vec{\theta}_{*}\right)\right] \leq \frac{G R}{\sqrt{t}}
$$

4. (1 point) Conclude that for any $\epsilon>0$, after $t=\frac{G^{2} R^{2}}{\epsilon^{2}}$ steps, letting $\hat{\theta}=\arg \min _{\vec{\theta}_{1}, \ldots, \vec{\theta}_{t}} f\left(\vec{\theta}_{i}\right)$,

$$
f(\hat{\theta})-f\left(\vec{\theta}_{*}\right) \leq \epsilon
$$

5. (2 points) In our analysis in class and above, we show that $f(\hat{\theta})-f\left(\vec{\theta}_{*}\right) \leq \epsilon$ for the best iterate $\hat{\theta}=\arg \min _{\vec{\theta}_{1}, \ldots, \vec{\theta}_{t}} f\left(\vec{\theta}_{i}\right)$. Prove that if we instead set $\bar{\theta}=\frac{1}{t} \sum_{i=1}^{t} \vec{\theta}_{i}$ (i.e., $\bar{\theta}$ is the average iterate) then we also have $f(\bar{\theta})-f\left(\vec{\theta}_{*}\right) \leq \epsilon$. This strategy is often used, e.g., when using stochastic gradient descent for large datasets, since determining the best iterate can be much more expensive than just storing a running average. Hint: Use the bound in part (3) along with the assumption that $f$ is convex.
